

included in the original validation study. Therefore, the validity of the calculated glycemic index values is essentially unknown. However, given the relatively low correlation coefficients for quantity of total carbohydrate, starches, and sucrose, it would seem unlikely that subtle differences in the quality (i.e., glycemic index) of that carbohydrate can be accurately assessed. The authors note that correlations for carbohydrate were higher in urban non-Hispanic white subjects (<20% of the sample) and that stratification for ethnicity did not alter their conclusions. However, due to the relatively small sample size, subanalysis may not have had sufficient statistical power to detect associations.

Interestingly, observational studies that found no association between glycemic index, glycemic load, and incidence of type 2 diabetes (8,9) also had validation correlation coefficients for total carbohydrate that were <0.5. In contrast, those studies finding glycemic index, glycemic load, or both to be predictive of diabetes (5,6,10) had *r* values >0.6.

Given the limitations of the IRAS study in relation to its ability to accurately assess total carbohydrate intake, starches, and sucrose, we believe that the conclusions drawn from the study of Liese et al., i.e., that glycemic index and glycemic load are not related to measures of insulin sensitivity, insulin secretion, and adiposity, should be interpreted with caution.

ALAN W. BARCLAY, BSC, GRAD DIP DIET
JENNIE C. BRAND-MILLER, PHD

From the School of Molecular and Microbial Biosciences, University of Sydney, NSW, Australia.

Address correspondence to Alan Barclay, University of Sydney, School of Molecular and Microbial Biosciences, Sydney, NSW, 2006, Australia. E-mail: awbarclay@optusnet.com.au.

J.C.B.-M. serves on the board of directors for Glycemic Index Limited.

DOI: 10.2337/dc06-0630

© 2006 by the American Diabetes Association.

References

- Liese AD, Schulz M, Fang F, Wolever TMS, D'Agostino RB Jr, Sparks KC, Mayer-Davis EJ: Dietary glycemic index and glycemic load, carbohydrate and fiber intake, and measures of insulin sensitivity, secretion, and adiposity in the Insulin Resistance Atherosclerosis Study. *Diabetes Care* 28:2832–2838, 2005
- Mayer-Davis EJ, Vitolins MZ, Carmichael SL, Hemphill S, Tsaroucha G, Rushing J, Levin S: Validity and reproducibility of a food frequency interview in a Multi-Cul-

tural Epidemiology Study. *Ann Epidemiol* 9:314–324, 1999

- Brunner E, Stallone D, Juneja M, Bingham S, Marmot M: Dietary assessment in Whitehall II: comparison of 7 d diet diary and food-frequency questionnaire and validity against biomarkers. *Br J Nutr* 86:405–414, 2001
- Willett WC: *Nutritional Epidemiology*. 2nd ed. Oxford, U.K., Oxford University Press, 1998
- Salmeron J, Manson JAE, Stampfer MJ, Colditz GA, Wing AL, Jenkins DJ, Wing AL, Willett WC: Dietary fiber, glycemic load, and risk of non-insulin-dependent diabetes mellitus in women. *JAMA* 277:472–477, 1997
- Salmeron J, Ascherio A, Rimm EB, Colditz GA, Spiegelman D, Jenkins DJ, Stampfer MJ, Wing AL, Willett WC: Dietary fiber, glycemic load, and risk of NIDDM in men. *Diabetes Care* 20:545–550, 1997
- Rimm EB, Giovannucci EL, Stampfer MJ, Colditz GA, Litin LB, Willett WC: Reproducibility and validity of an expanded self-administered semiquantitative food frequency questionnaire among male health professionals. *Am J Epidemiol* 135:1114–1126, 1992
- Meyer KA, Kushi LH, Jacobs DR Jr, Slavin J, Sellers TA, Folsom AR: Carbohydrates, dietary fiber, and incident type 2 diabetes in older women. *Am J Clin Nutr* 71:921–930, 2000
- Stevens J, Ahn K, Juhaeri, Houston D, Steffan L, Couper D: Dietary fiber intake and glycemic index and incidence of diabetes in African-American and white adults: the ARIC study. *Diabetes Care* 25:1715–1721, 2002
- Schulze MB, Liu S, Rimm EB, Manson JE, Willett WC, Hu FB: Glycemic index, glycemic load, and dietary fiber intake and incidence of type 2 diabetes in younger and middle-aged women. *Am J Clin Nutr* 80:348–356, 2004

A Single Factor Underlies the Metabolic Syndrome: A Confirmatory Factor Analysis

Response to Pladevall et al.

We were pleased to see the article by Pladevall et al. (1) in a recent issue of *Diabetes Care*, as it extends our prior results to Spanish and Mauritian samples. While the authors suggest that their findings differ from our results in the Normative Aging Study (2), we wish to clarify that we had previously demonstrated that a single

factor underlies components of the metabolic syndrome using confirmatory factor analysis.

In our report, we showed that 10 risk factors associated with the metabolic syndrome were predicted by one primary factor, albeit through subfactors of insulin resistance, obesity, lipids, and blood pressure. The report of Pladevall et al. and the recently published review by Kahn et al. (3) refer to our model as a “correlated-factor model” or “four-factor model.” However, our analyses went well beyond a model of correlated factors to establish that the four subfactors were not only correlated but indeed predicted by a single common factor (second-order factor) (Fig. 1 in ref. 2), which we labeled the metabolic syndrome. Furthermore, it should be noted that with a second-order factor, we have found that it is possible to include the full complement of components of the metabolic syndrome in confirmatory factor analysis. For example, it is possible to include both systolic and diastolic blood pressure, consistent with current metabolic syndrome criteria, rather than mean arterial pressure alone.

JEANNE M. MCCAFFERY, PHD¹
BIING-JIUN SHEN, PHD²
JOHN F. TODARO, PHD³
RAYMOND S. NIAURA, PHD⁴

From the ¹Weight Control and Diabetes Research Center, Miriam Hospital and Brown Medical School, Providence, Rhode Island; the ²Department of Psychology, University of Miami, Miami, Florida; the ³Centers for Behavioral and Preventive Medicine, Miriam Hospital and Brown Medical School, Providence, Rhode Island; and the ⁴Transdisciplinary Research Group, Butler Hospital and Brown Medical School, Providence, Rhode Island.

Address correspondence to Jeanne M. McCaffery, PhD, Weight Control and Diabetes Research Center, Miriam Hospital and Brown Medical School, 196 Richmond St., Providence, RI 02903. E-mail: jeanne_mccaffery@brown.edu.

DOI: 10.2337/dc06-0583

© 2006 by the American Diabetes Association.

References

- Pladevall M, Singal B, Williams LK, Brotons C, Guyer H, Sadurni J, Falces C, Serrano-Rios M, Gabriel R, Shaw JE, Zimmet PZ, Haffner S: A single factor underlies the metabolic syndrome: a confirmatory factor analysis. *Diabetes Care* 29:113–122, 2006
- Shen BJ, Todaro JF, Niaura R, McCaffery JM, Zhang J, Spiro A 3rd, Ward KD: Are metabolic risk factors one unified syndrome? Modeling the structure of the metabolic syndrome X. *Am J Epidemiol* 157:701–711, 2003